

National Institutes of Health Bethesda, Maryland 20892

Building: 31 Room: 7A03 Phone: (301) 496-2263 Fax: (301) 496-4409

May 6, 1991

Professor Joshua Lederberg The Rockefeller University New York, NY 10021-6399

Dear Josh:



I am returning the manuscript entitled "Activation-induced death by apoptosis in CD4 T cells from HIV-infected asymptomatic individuals" by Groux, et al. which you sent me to review for PNAS. I have already reviewed this paper for Science. I mentioned to the editors of Science in my review that there were a number of changes and questions that I felt the authors should address. For your information, I am sending you a copy of the review that I did for their Science paper, as well as a copy of the paper which they submitted to Science. As you can see, it is essentially the same as they submitted to PNAS with a change in format appropriate for the journal. As you can see in my review for the Science paper, I felt that it represents an interesting observation; however, there are a number of questions and problems which need to be addressed. I do not think it would be fair to the reviewers to have the same person review the same paper for two different journals. They should really get a fresh look. From my perspective, I think that with some changes it could be a reasonable paper for PNAS. However, I would recommend that you send it to someone else and if they feel the same way, then you can complement that with my own feeling that fundamentally it is an interesting piece of work that could be improved with some modification.

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to see this paper. Best personal regards.

Sincerely,

Anthony S. Fauci, M.D.

Director

National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases

ASF:1r

Enclosures

Thoulings, Tony.

Thoulings, Tony.

Thousand owners that science.

See submitted to Science.